

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT

DISTRICT OF NEVADA

* * *

SPENCER PIERCE,

Plaintiff,

v.

HOWARD SKOLNIK, et al.,

Defendants.

Case No. 3:10-cv-00239-MMD-VPC

ORDER

In its January 2, 2014, memorandum disposition, the Ninth Circuit reversed the Court's decision to decline to consider Plaintiff's allegation that defendant Michael Koehn retaliated against him for filing grievances. (Dkt. no. 111.) The Ninth Circuit remanded with instruction to address Plaintiff's retaliation claim and provide him with the opportunity to amend if needed.

Count I of Plaintiff's Third Amended Complaint contains a single sentence that references Koehn's alleged action against Plaintiff for filing grievances. In particular, Plaintiff alleges that Defendant Koehn "stopped the ibuprofen and muscle relaxant, had plaintiff removed to the infirmary, where he threaten plaintiff for complaints and filing grievances." (Dkt. no. 38 at 8.) Plaintiff further alleges that Koehn stopped referrals to an orthopedic and neurologist from being processed and stopped medications for diabetics and high cholesterol "out of retaliation." (*Id.*)

"Prisoners have a First Amendment right to file grievances against prison officials and to be free from retaliation for doing so." *Watison v. Carter*, 668 F.3d 1108, 1113-

1 1114 (9th Cir. 2012). To establish a claim for retaliation, a plaintiff must allege five
2 essential elements: (1) plaintiff engaged in protected conduct (i.e., filing an inmate
3 grievance); (2) defendant took adverse action against plaintiff; (3) there is a causal
4 connection between the adverse action and the protected conduct; (4) defendant's "acts
5 would chill or silence a person of ordinary firmness from future First Amendment
6 activities"; and (5) the "retaliatory action did not advance legitimate goals of the
7 correctional institution." *Id.*, quoting *Rhodes v. Robinson*, 408 F.3d 559, 568 (9th Cir.
8 2005) & *Rizzo v. Dawson*, 778 F.2d 527, 532 (9th Cir. 1985). To satisfy the last element,
9 allegations that defendant's action was "arbitrary and capricious" or was "unnecessary
10 to the maintenance of order in the institution" will suffice. *Id.* at 1114-15, quoting *Rizzo*,
11 *id.* & *Franklin v. Murphy*, 745 F.2d 1221, 1230 (9th Cir. 1984).

12 The Court cannot determine from Plaintiff's reference to Koehn's actions with
13 respect to his complaints and grievance filings whether he can allege sufficient facts to
14 support a claim for retaliation under the First Amendment. Plaintiff will be given leave to
15 file a fourth amended complaint to allege a claim for retaliation to meet the five (5)
16 essential elements referenced above. If Plaintiff chooses to file an amended complaint
17 he is advised that an amended complaint supersedes the original complaint and, thus,
18 the amended complaint must be complete in itself. See *Hal Roach Studios, Inc. v.*
19 *Richard Feiner & Co., Inc.*, 896 F.2d 1542, 1546 (9th Cir. 1989) (holding that "[t]he fact
20 that a party was named in the original complaint is irrelevant; an amended pleading
21 supersedes the original"); see also *Lacey v. Maricopa Cnty.*, 693 F.3d 896, 928 (9th Cir.
22 2012) (holding that for claims dismissed with prejudice, a plaintiff is not required to
23 reallege such claims in a subsequent amended complaint to preserve them for appeal).
24 Plaintiff's amended complaint must contain allegations against the sole remaining
25 defendant, Michael Koehn, to support Plaintiff's retaliation claim under the First
26 Amendment. Moreover, Plaintiff must file the amended complaint on this Court's
27 approved prisoner civil rights form and it must be entitled "Fourth Amended Complaint."

28 ///

1 It is therefore ordered that Plaintiff has thirty (30) days to file a fourth amended
2 complaint. The Clerk of the Court shall send to Plaintiff the approved form for filing a §
3 1983 complaint, instructions for the same, and a copy of his Third Amended Complaint
4 (dkt. no. 38).

5 DATED THIS 13th day of January 2014.

6
7 

8 MIRANDA M. DU
9 UNITED STATES DISTRICT JUDGE
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28